Believing & Doubting Worksheet

Read the paper once without worrying about these questions, and then answer the questions, referring to the paper and re-reading it as needed.

1. Mirroring: What is the main point of the paper? (Summarize in no more than three sentences)

2. Believing: Accept the writer's point of view and try to extend the paper's argument--provide additional examples, suggest questions that might provoke further thought, discuss parallels.

3. Doubting: Provide counter-evidence and counterarguments for the author. If you did not accept this argument, what objections might you raise? Are there other solutions or interpretations for this problem? Pursue one counterargument at length or suggest several concerns more briefly.

4. Suggesting: Based on your experience as a writer, what suggestions might you give this author? This is the time to warn the author if the paper merely repeats class lecture, discussion, or articles we have read, or if the paper allows extended plot summary to displace development of argument. Is the thesis a hypothesis or a statement of fact? Are there any places where the argument seems to get off track? This is also a chance to suggest revision tactics, remark on the essay's style, proportions, etc.