

Reed College
Human Subjects Research Committee (IRB)
Project Approval Form 2003/2004

NOTE: Please download to your computer and use Word to supply requested info.

COVER PAGE

Project Title: Commodifying *La Frontera*: The Distribution and Impact of Advertising on the US-Mexican Border

Submission Date: 5/3/04

Name of Primary Investigator: Daniel Denvir

Address: 3817 SE Woodstock Blvd. MS 331 Portland, OR 97202

Faculty Advisor (if applicable): Charlene Makley

Signature of Faculty Advisor: (signature indicates that the proposal has been read and approved.)

Please indicate your agreement to the following stipulation:

I will promptly report changes in the proposed study and any unanticipated problems involving risks to participants, including adverse reactions, to the Human Subjects Research Committee.

Signature of Primary Investigator

If your submission is **similar to** a submission that has been approved previously (within the past two academic years, 2001-2003), please identify that proposal by Project Name and Primary Investigator. Because we are changing the format of proposals so radically (fall, 2003), you will need to fill out this new form fully.

However, the process of review will be aided by reference to the previous proposal.

Interview Practices Similar to those of Annashay Sutherland

Project name: Developing Identity: Navigating Indigenouness (Senior Thesis: in progress)

A. BASIC PROTOCOL INFORMATION:

1. Is this study being performed at sites other than the Reed College campus?
YES NO

If YES, list other sites:

The El Paso-Ciudad Juárez metropolitan area.

2. Is this study being funded by the federal government or by some other agency that requires certification of review by the Reed College HSRC?
YES NO

If YES, list funding information (including agency and protocol number) and append a copy of the funding application.

3. Does the research require approval from one or more non-Reed organization(s) or IRB(s)?
YES NO

If YES, does the other organization/IRB require review by Reed's HSRC (IRB)?

YES NO

Attach application to other organization and, if approval has been granted, documentation of the approval.

NOTE: If the study is not federally funded and will be run at an off-campus site, AND if the research has been approved by an appropriate off-campus IRB, STOP HERE. Submit only the Cover Page, this page of the application, and the approved application to the off-campus IRB.

4. Although the IRB ultimately determines which type of review your protocol will receive, please consult the guidelines in the document entitled "Categories of Review" and then check the category of review you believe applies.

Exempt

Expedited

Full

5. Please indicate whether the primary focus of your research will be on one or more of the following populations:

Children (individuals <18 years) **COMPLETE APPENDIX A**

Individuals who are or may be decisionally impaired

Prisoners

Individuals who live outside the US COMPLETE APPENDIX B
Non-English speakers COMPLETE LANGUAGE SECTION,
APPENDIX B

Elected or appointed public officials or candidates for public office

B. SUMMARY (all categories of review, 3-5 sentences)

6. Provide a brief summary of the purpose of the research.

The project seeks to examine the distribution and effects of advertisements on the US-Mexican border. To this end, Denvir will, advised by Makley, conduct short interviews with people encountered in the El Paso-Ciudad Juárez metropolitan area. The interview will be comprised of questions aimed at exploring the subject's relationships with and beliefs towards advertisements.

- A. **BACKGROUND** (only if your proposal requires Full Review, 500 words maximum)

7. Provide a brief summary of prior, relevant research findings and the importance of the knowledge you expect to gain.

A large body of anthropological research has explored, respectively, advertising and international borders—none on how advertising and borders interact. In terms of the fieldwork that I hope to do at an advertising agency, I plan to draw heavily on William Mazzarella's office fieldwork, as office-based fieldwork is an emerging field in Anthropology. In a personal communication, Mazzarella suggested that I try to get myself assigned to a particular client account so as to be able to follow the process of ad-making from beginning until end. Just as advertising is, ostensibly, emblematic of the late-capitalist abstraction of identity from space, place and time, international borders are seen as foundational for the modern nation-state. From an anthropological perspective, advertising is central to the *processes* of modernity rather than a reflection of those processes (Mazzarella 2003: 25-26). For Mazzarella's thesis, there is an important gap between the advertised ideal and people's concrete realities (2003: 20). We aim to examine how advertisers navigate that gap, laden with ethnic, linguistic, class and gender difference, to get at their target audiences and, in return, how people react to being targets of advertising.

Importantly, the US-Mexico border is the "birthplace" of border studies more generally in North American social theory (Johnson & Michaelsen 1997: 1). In recent writings on border theory, the production and maintenance of cultural difference and hybridity are central. Interestingly, as national borders both materially and discursively inscribe difference onto local communities, global capitalism increasingly depends on shaping notions of identity and economic difference to both cultivate consumers' desire towards commodities and to produce labor markets. In our research on the Ciudad Juárez-El Paso we endeavor to analyze what values, both directly economic and not, are inscribed onto the commodity in the process of advertising. We aim to explore how advertisements

appeal to identity categories of class, gender, sexuality, ethnicity and nationality and how the production and maintenance of given categories affects the material relations to production.

B. PARTICIPANTS (all categories of review)

1. Does your research involve only accessing an existing database(s)?
YES NO

If YES, list the database(s) and then **SKIP TO** Section G, and fill out items 2-4.

8. Describe the participant population.

The participant population includes adult males and females from numerous class and geographical backgrounds. Mexican, caucasian North American and black North American are ethnic groups well represented on the US-Mexican border. There are also a considerable number of immigrants from other countries, often Central American, including persons from indigenous communities.

NOTE: If your study involves only...

the observation of public behavior of elected or appointed public officials
or candidates for office

research on normal educational practices in accepted educational
settings, in which any presentation or publication of the data will not
identify individual participants

...STOP HERE and do not submit the remaining pages of this form.

9. Identify all criteria for inclusion and exclusion of participants. Provide rationales where these may not be obvious.

a. Inclusion: **Anyone of seeming psychological normalcy encountered on the street, in business establishments (including an advertising firm) or through non-profits are potential subjects for formal interviews.**

b. Exclusion: **Anyone who appears to be psychologically unstable.**

10. Recruitment

NOTE: If your study involves only the observation of public behavior, check here and **SKIP TO** Sections G and H.

- a. How will potential participants be identified?

Potential participants for formal interviews will be identified, for example, as arranged through a business or non-profit as well as through chance encounter in public spaces.

NOTE: Attach recruitment ads and/or letters if appropriate.

If it is not obvious from the recruitment ad or letter:

- b. How will potential participants be screened for inclusion and exclusion criteria?

They will simply be asked if they would mind discussing advertisements more generally and/ or a particular ad specifically. If they are interested, I will obtain oral consent.

- c. What will they be told about the purposes of the research before being asked for consent to participate?

My consent script, delivered orally, will inform the potential participant that I am researching advertising and how people think and feel about ads.

E. PROCEDURES (all categories of review EXCEPT as indicated in Section D)

1. Provide the following information:

- a. Expected duration of individual participation:

Between 10 and 15 minutes.

- b. Study location(s):

Business place, non-profit office, the street and other public spaces.

- c. Type or amount of compensation to participant, if any:

There will be no compensation for these short interviews. They will be undertaken in a straightfoward but casual manner. Area residents providing food and/or housing will be compensated.

11. Provide a specific description of what each participant will be asked to experience or to do.

The interviews are best described as unstructured. I will have a set of basic questions that I will ask of each participant—place of origin, political affiliation, age—as well as a number of general questions about advertising. From these answers, I intend to ask participant-specific follow up questions.

NOTE: Append all questionnaires, surveys, and sample items from computerized tasks.

NOTE: For structured interviews, provide interview protocol. For unstructured interviews, describe the goals of the interview and any topics to be avoided. Approved research protocols may be listed by name.

Through formal interviews, we aim to explore the following questions: How do advertisers negotiate the heterogeneous linguistic ideologies and practices on the border? How do ads interact with border asymmetries of production and consumption? To which communities, on which side of the border, are ads targeted? What kinds of commodities are targeted to which demographics? To which sites of consumption, on which side of the border, do ads aim to cultivate desire? How does the business community as a whole on each side of the border metropolis “package” their city as a whole as a tourist commodity?

For formal interviews, Denvir will ask basic questions about people’s general thoughts on advertisements, both generally and specific ads. Also, Denvir will ask questions pertaining to how subjects perceive ethnicity, class, gender, nationality and language as portrayed in ads. Denvir will avoid asking any questions pertaining to immigration status or anything that would compell a subject to offer his/her name. In interviewing advertisers, Denvir will ask questions pertaining to how advertisers perceive the targets of their ads in terms of ethnicity, class, gender, nationality and language and how such perceptions influence their advertising practices.

F. RISK/BENEFIT ASSESSMENT (all categories of review EXCEPT as indicated in Section D)

12. Benefits

Describe the potential direct and indirect benefits, if any, to participants.

There are no direct benefits to participants in most interviews. Indirect benefits will hopefully accrue in providing a map for social activists of how corporations employ advertisements to intervene, sometimes harmfully, in local constructions of race, gender, language and nationality. We hope to better elucidate the ways in which advertising’s often masked presence works in major ways to shape the social life of the border region.

I am hesitant to introduce money or rewards into such a brief, casual conversation. Benefits, in terms of monetary remuneration, will be provided to my host family and anyone else providing me with long-term support.

NOTE: Incentives for participation should not be included here.

2. Risks

- a. Indicate whether the research involves any of the following by checking in front of applicable items:

Deception

Procedures that may result in mental or emotional stress, such as induction of negative mood, damage to self-esteem, manipulation of attitudes, exposure to aversive stimuli

Procedures that may involve physical harm to participants, such as ingestion of any substance, physical exercise, invasive physiological measurements

Presentation of materials and/or behaviors commonly regarded as socially unacceptable within the setting of the research

*Procedures that might be regarded as invading privacy

*Possible/probable disclosure of information that could be harmful to participant (e.g., criminal behavior, immigration status, information that might affect academic or employment status, information that could affect the participant's reputation or be considered stigmatizing)

The potential revelation of a subject's immigration status is the only one of the aforementioned items that seems of possibility. As only pseudonyms will be taken in tape-recorded interviews and subjects will not be asked about their immigration status, the potential revelation of said status certainly seems negligible.

- d. For each of the risks indicated above:

- i. Describe why the procedure is necessary. If possible, provide at least one previous reference upon which your procedure(s) is/are based, indicating and justifying any changes you have made to this procedure.

Interviewing people with variable immigration statuses is necessary to any ethnographic work on the US-Mexican border as people with potentially illegal immigration status make up a large part of the border population.

NOTE: Append additional pages if necessary.

- ii. Describe how you will minimize any risks posed.

I will make sure to use pseudonyms in the documentation (both written and tape-recorded) of all interviews. Moreover, I will emphasize that participant's should feel free not to answer any questions that they would rather not speak to.

G. CONFIDENTIALITY ISSUES

1. Will you be audio/video taping or photographing participants?

YES NO

If YES:

Provide a rationale for taping/photographing. Describe confidentiality procedures, including what will become of records after use (e.g. shown at scientific meetings, erased), the final disposition of the records (e.g. destruction, archiving), and a reasonable timeline for this disposition.

I will need to audio record interviews because a full transcription of interviews will be necessary for post-fieldwork research. Both my advisor and collaborator Professor Charlene Makley and myself will retain copies of the audio recordings and field notes for future research.

NOTE: Be sure to include a separate signature line for permission to tape or photograph in the informed consent document. Where written consent is waived by the IRB, participants should be asked to confirm their consent as part of the recorded material.

13. Will you be collecting any obvious identifiers (names, social security numbers, detailed physical descriptions, genealogies, addresses, etc.?)

YES NO

3. Will you be collecting data that, when considered in light of the potential participant pool, could lead to the identification of an individual participant? Examples include autobiographical accounts or identifiable patterns of demographic information.

YES **NO**

If YES to either of these questions (2. or 3.):

- a. Specify to the extent possible what information will be collected and why.
- e. Specify the procedures for coding and/or storing the data so that confidentiality of individual participant data is protected.

4. If data are coded, will you retain a master list linking study codes and direct identifiers? YES NO

If YES, explain why this is necessary, how and where you will secure the master list, and how long it will be kept.

5. Please provide the following information about confidentiality of data:

14. a. Will information that could identify the participant be shared in any way?

YES **NO**

If YES, explain.

- b. Describe your plan for presentation and/or publication, as well as data retention and future use of records.

Data in the form of transcriptions and analyses of audio recorded ethnographic interviews will form an integral part of a broader study on advertising on the US-Mexican border.

H. INFORMED CONSENT (all categories of review EXCEPT as indicated in Section D)

15. Please note whether written informed consent will be sought from all participants, or whether a waiver is being requested. **(If so, complete APPENDIX C.)**

Written informed consent will be sought from all participants.

Waiver of written consent is being requested. Verbal consent will be sought from participants.

Waiver of informed consent is being requested.

NOTE: APPEND ALL CONSENT DOCUMENTS AND/OR SCRIPTS.

16. Describe the context in which consent will be sought, when consent will be sought, how often consent will be sought (if appropriate), as well as who will be responsible for seeking consent from participants.

Consent will be sought by Dan Denvir, the primary investigator, preceding each formal interview.

Reed College
Human Subjects Research Committee (IRB)
Appendices to Project Approval Form 2003/2004

Feel free to unprotect this document (after you've answered the required questions pertaining to your proposal) by selecting "Unprotect Document..." in the Tools Menu. This will allow you to delete any inapplicable Appendices, and will save paper, as well as decrease file size.

****Know that once you have unprotected the Appendices, however, you should leave it unprotected. Selecting "Protect Document..." at this point will cause you to lose the answers you've inserted.**

Appendix B. International Research or Research with Non-English Speaking Participants

17. If the research has not undergone IRB or equivalent ethics committee review from the host country or performance site, provide a rationale.

There is no overriding applicable supervisory body.

Note: The HSRC recognizes that such review is not always possible or appropriate.

18. Specify your familiarity with and/or knowledge of the local research context.

I have extensively researched the US-Mexican border, in matters political, economic, cultural and historical.

19. Specify additional risks participants might face as a result of their membership in the population being studied and/or as a result of the local research context. Indicate how you intend to minimize these risks.

As mentioned in the main body of the Project Approval Form, immigration status is the primary risk that US-Mexican border communities face. To minimize these risks, information pertaining to immigration status will be neither solicited nor recorded.

20. Language Issues
In what language(s) will the research be conducted?

Spanish and English.

Are you fluent in this language, or will a translator be used?

I am fluent in English and competent in Spanish.

If a translator will be used, how will the translator be identified and trained in confidentiality issues? If the use of a translator poses any additional risk to participants, indicate how you will minimize these risks?

I will translate the transcripts of taped interviews personally. Additionally, a Reed student with Spanish fluency will be employed to review the transcriptions.

Indicate how the consent documents/scripts and research instruments will be translated.

The consent scripts have already been translated by myself under the direction of Bridget Hayden, Professor of Anthropology.

21. Confidentiality

Specify how data will be taken out of the country, including the procedures in place to protect confidentiality.

The data will leave Mexico with me, crossing the international border by foot. Although all traffic across the US-Mexican border is subject to thorough scrutiny by the United States Government, I do not anticipate that the identities of any participants could be derived from my notes or tape recordings of interviews.

Appendix C. Request for Waiver or Alteration of Informed Consent

1. Waiver of Written Informed Consent

Written consent may be waived for this research because:

The only record linking the participant and the research would be the consent document AND the principal risk to participants is potential harm resulting from breach of confidentiality via the consent document. Each participant will be asked whether the participant wants documentation linking her/him with the research and the participant's wishes will govern.

OR

The research presents no more than minimal risk of harm to participants (for example, none of the risks in Section F.2) and involves no procedures for which written consent is normally required outside of the research context.

If a waiver of written consent is granted by the HSRC, verbal consent must be sought and documented.

In place of written consent, I will obtain verbal/spoken consent. Describe how verbal consent will be documented.

As these interviews will put participants at minimal risk, I would like to receive a waiver of written informed consent. Moreover, as many potential participants may be illiterate, written consent might often not convey true consent on the part of the participant. Verbal consent will be obtained through a recitation of the oral consent form, answering questions and securing the participant's oral agreement to the interview.

22. Waiver of Informed Consent

In certain cases, the requirement for consent can be waived altogether. **ALL** of the following conditions must be met in order for the research to be eligible for a waiver:

1. The research presents no more than minimal risk of harm to participants.
2. The waiver will not adversely affect the rights and welfare of the participants.
3. The research could not practicably be carried out without the waiver.
4. Whenever appropriate, the participants will be provided with additional pertinent information after participation.

Please outline your arguments in support of this request.

Oral PARTICIPANT CONSENT SCRIPT

“Ethnographic Interviews with People in El Paso and Ciudad Juárez”

I, (Dan Denvir, Anthropology student at Reed College, Portland, OR USA), invite you to contribute to a research project on advertising on the US-Mexican border. I am undertaking this research with Professor Charlene Makley, my academic advisor and an Anthropologist at Reed College in Portland, Oregon. My paper is about why advertisements are put where they are in border cities and what people think about them. Your personal experience on the border will be a valuable asset to this study.

Your participation involves an interview with me, which will take between ten and fifteen minutes. With your permission, I will tape record this interview, but if you are not comfortable being tape-recorded I will record your answers by hand. Your participation in this study will be entirely confidential, which means that only my academic advisor and I will have access to the tapes after the interview. I intend to keep these records for use in possible future projects, but I will keep careful track of them so that no one else gains access, and I will not use your name or any details that could personally identify you in my written documents. If you agree to this, I might quote your exact words in my thesis, again without any identifying information.

Also, your participation in this study is voluntary. It's important to me that you feel comfortable and know that you may refuse to answer any question at any time, or stop the interview altogether at any time. At any time before the end of the interview, you may request that I erase all or part of your previously recorded answers.

I will give you my contact information and I will be glad to answer any questions or doubts about my study. You can also address questions or doubts about the project to my advisor, Charlene Makley, an anthropologist; I will give you her contact information as well.

Spanish Version

Soy Dan Denvir, estudiante de antropología en Reed College, Portland, Oregon, Estados Unidos. A usted le invito a participar en un proyecto de investigación. Estoy escribiendo sobre poque la publicidad se pone donde está en las ciudades de la frontera y que las personans piensan sobre ella. Sus experiencias personales en la frontera serán contribuciones substanciales a mi proyecto.

Su participación en este estudio involucra una entrevista conmigo, de una duración de entre diez y veinte minutos. Con su permisión, grabaré a esta entrevista con grabadora de cassettes, pero si no está cómodo(a) con la grabación, tomaré sus respuestas a mano. Su participación es totalmente confidencial, que quiere decir que 1) soy la única persona quién tendrá acceso a los cassettes después de la entrevista (aunque los guardaré para posiblemente utilizar en proyectos en el futuro) y que no 2) usaré su nombre verdadero ni 3) detalles/datos personales que Ud. no quiere incluir en ningún documento escrito. Sin embargo, si Usted está de acuerdo, yo podría citar sus palabras directas en el proyecto, pero en este caso cambiaré información alguna que identificaría a Usted.

Es necesario que Usted sepa que su participación es totalmente opcional. Para mí es muy importante que Usted se siente cómodo(a), y sabe que puede negar a responder a cualquier pregunta mía cuando quiera y también decidir simplemente terminar con la entrevista en cualquier momento. En cualquier momento antes de

que se termine la entrevista, Ud. puede pedir a borrar partes o todas de sus respuestas previas. También si tiene preguntas o preocupaciones por el estudio le daré los datos de contacto para mi tutor académico, Charlene Makley, una antropóloga—pero ella no habla español.

Printed Version:

Your participation in this interview-based study is voluntary. I will be glad to answer any questions you may have about the study. (Dan Denvir, Box 331 Reed College, 3203 SE Woodstock Blvd. Portland, OR 97202, 503-788-1833, dan.denvir@reed.edu). If you have other questions or concerns about this study, you may also contact my academic advisor, Charlene Makley, an anthropologist (Reed College, Department of Anthropology, Portland Oregon, 97202, USA; charlene.makley@reed.edu) or Dell Rhodes, Chair of the Reed College Human Subjects Research Committee (Reed College, Portland, Oregon, 97202 USA; dell.rhodes@reed.edu).

Su participación en esta entrevista es voluntaria. Yo estaré dispuesta a responder a cualquier pregunta que tenga Ud. sobre el estudio. Mis datos de contacto son: Dan Denvir, Reed College Box 331, 3203 SE Woodstock Blvd., Portland, OR 97202, dan.denvir@reed.edu. Si tiene otras preguntas o dudas sobre mi estudio, puede también contactar a mi tutor académico, Charlene Makley, una antropóloga (Reed College, Department of Anthropology, Portland Oregon, 97202, USA; charlene.makley@reed.edu) o Dell Rhodes, Jefa del Reed College Human Subjects Research Committee (Reed College, Portland, Oregon, 97202 USA; dell.rhodes@reed.edu).